

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33

Effects of ‘Fair Play Game’ strategy on Moderate to Vigorous Physical Activity in Physical  
Education

Azevedo, L.B.<sup>1\*</sup>, Vidoni, C.<sup>2</sup> & Dinsdale S.L.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1\*</sup>Corresponding Author: Liane Beretta Azevedo, PhD, Teesside University, School of Health and Social Care, Middlesbrough, Tees Valley, TS1 3BA UK.  
Email: [l.azevedo@tees.ac.uk](mailto:l.azevedo@tees.ac.uk); Phone: +44 - 0 - 1642 342988

<sup>2</sup>Carla Vidoni, PhD, Department of Health & Sport Sciences, University of Louisville, Louisville, KY, 40292, USA.  
Email: [carla.vidoni@louisville.edu](mailto:carla.vidoni@louisville.edu), Phone: +1 - 502 - 852-8844

<sup>3</sup>Sarah-Louise Dinsdale, Teesside University, School of Health and Social Care, Middlesbrough, Tees Valley, TS1 3BA UK,  
Email: [s.dinsdale@tees.ac.uk](mailto:s.dinsdale@tees.ac.uk), Phone:+44 - 0 - 1642 342967

Running head: Effect of group contingency strategy on physical education

**Acknowledgments**

We would like to thank all the participants, teacher and school for their support of this research. We would also like to thank the University of Louisville, Research Initiation Grant for contributing to this study.

34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58

**Abstract**

Less than 50% of a physical education (PE) lessons are usually spent in moderate to vigorous physical activity (MVPA). A dependent-group contingency strategy, 'Fair Play Game,' has shown effectiveness in increasing MVPA during PE lessons among students from affluent schools. The purpose of this study was to determine the effectiveness of this strategy on MVPA among students from an undeserved community. The 'Fair Play Game' strategy consisted of goal setting, prompts, feedback, and rewards. A single-subject multiple baseline design was applied across two classes of students, throughout 15 soccer lessons. Three students from each class (N=6) were selected for an individual analysis according to their MVPA level at baseline (low, medium and high). Students wore a waist-mounted accelerometer during lessons. Students with a low level of MVPA at baseline from Year 8, presented a positive change in trend, level and percentage of non-overlapping on % MVPA data. The intervention was not effective to change MVPA for the other students. The 'Fair Play Game' might be effective in increasing physical activity levels in students with low levels of activity from undeserved areas. However, the intervention needs to be tailored for each population and applied regularly for the benefits to be expanded to the whole class.

*Keywords:* Fair Play Game; Single subject; Visual analysis; Accelerometer; Physical education

59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83

## Introduction

Only one-third of children meet the current recommendation of 60 minutes of moderate to vigorous physical activity (MVPA) per day in England (Health Survey for England, 2008). Likewise children from lower socioeconomic status groups tend to engage in lower levels of physical activity (PA) (Carlson, Mignano, Norman, McKenzie, & Kerr, 2014) and higher levels of sedentary behavior (Brodersen, Steptoe, Boniface, & Wardle, 2007). Schools are seen as the main setting to encourage PA in children (De Bourdeaudhuij et al., 2011; van Sluijs, McMinn, & Griffin., 2008) and physical education (PE) is considered an ideal opportunity for promotion of regular PA (Sallis & McKenzie, 1991).

In the year 2000, Healthy People 2010 (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2000) recommended that at least 50% of PE lesson time should be spent on MVPA, which has been supported further by the Centre for Disease and Control (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2010). However, a review study concluded that middle and high school students spent only 40% of the PE lesson in MVPA (Fairclough & Stratton, 2005).

More recently, an analytical review by Sallis et al. (2012) described new goals for achieving Health Optimizing Physical Education (HOPE), defined as: physical education that encompasses curriculum and lessons focused on health-related physical activity and fitness. The authors stated the importance of emphasizing high levels of MVPA during PE lessons. Furthermore, they suggested goals for the next 20 years, including the need for studies on PE to incorporate objective measures to assess MVPA levels, whilst also focussing on developing low-cost and feasible methods for teachers to accurately assess this in classes (Sallis et al., 2012).

Some studies have implemented interventions designed to increase MVPA levels during PE lessons. Results from systematic reviews revealed that interventions tend to

## Effect of group contingency strategy on physical education

84 promote a net increase of 10% in the amount of time spent in MVPA during lesson time  
85 (Kahn et al., 2002; Lonsdale et al., 2013). Several strategies have been used successfully to  
86 increase MVPA levels during PE lessons including: professional learning focused on teacher  
87 pedagogy, management and instruction, and adding high-intensity activity to the usual PE  
88 lessons (Lonsdale et al., 2013).

89 One approach that has shown to be effective in increasing PE students' levels of  
90 physical activity is the 'Fair Play Game'. The term 'Fair Play Game' was based on the Sport  
91 Education Fair Play Code of Conduct (Siedentop, Hastie, & van der Mars, 2011) which  
92 addresses students' participation, responsibility, effort, respect, and being a good sport that is  
93 helpful and not harmful to others. The development of the strategy was inspired by The Good  
94 Behavior Game (Barrish, Saunders, & Wolf, 1969), which aimed to decrease disruptive  
95 classroom behaviors in an elementary school. The 'Fair Play Game' is a dependent-group-  
96 contingency strategy that can help PE teachers to set goals for social or active behaviors and  
97 hold students accountable, when working in teams. More specifically, the strategy consists of  
98 setting daily goals to teams and awarding points to when teams accomplish them. This is not  
99 done to produce competition between teams, but instead provides a challenge within teams to  
100 overcome previous goals. It also includes public posting (i.e. a chart on the wall) of daily  
101 goals, teacher's prompts, and feedback about the desired behaviors to be accomplished by the  
102 teams. As a dependent group contingency strategy (Cooper, Heron & Heward, 2007), the  
103 'Fair Play Game' requires the teacher to track one unidentified member of each team's  
104 performance, against the goal-setting chart relating to that particular team. If the unidentified  
105 team member accomplishes the daily goal, the team is awarded with a point, a mark or a  
106 smiley face (Vidoni & Ulman, 2012). Every day a different unidentified member is randomly  
107 selected. As the selected individual is not identified, this typically results in the whole team  
108 making the effort to achieve the daily goal.

109 More recently, two studies showed positive effects of the implementation of ‘Fair  
110 Play Game’ (Vidoni, Azevedo & Eberline, 2012; Vidoni, Lee & Azevedo, 2014) on middle  
111 school students’ active behaviors in PE lessons, measured by heart rate monitors and  
112 pedometers, respectively. However, despite the ‘Fair Play Game’ strategy showing positive  
113 results in American middle to high socio-economic class students, there is still a need to  
114 examine its effectiveness in a more underserved community, where lower levels of physical  
115 activity are evident (Brodersen et ., 2007; Stalsberg & Pedersen, 2010).

116 In addition, the ‘Fair Play Game’ has not yet been assessed using accelerometers,  
117 which provide an objective and more accurate measure of physical activity than previously  
118 used monitors (Trost, 2001; Trost, Loprinzi, Moore & Pfeiffer, 2011). Therefore, the purpose  
119 of this study was to investigate the effects of the ‘Fair Play Game’ on objectively measured  
120 MVPA levels, among secondary school students from an underserved area in the UK, with  
121 different levels of physical activity, during PE lessons.

## 122 **Methods**

### 123 **Participants and Setting**

124 Participants were from two classes: Year 8 (12-13 years old) and Year 9 (13-14 years  
125 old). They were boys from a secondary school in an underserved area of England, based on  
126 the index of multiple deprivation (IMD) and eligibility for free school meals (FSM). IMD is a  
127 small-area based marker of deprivation based on measures of income, employment, health  
128 and disability, education, skills and training, barriers to housing and services, crime, and the  
129 living environment. Small areas, across England, are ranked from 1 to 32,482, with a rating  
130 of 1 indicating the most underserved, and 32,482 being the least underserved. (Noble et al.,  
131 2004). Eligibility for free-school meals is considered another proxy measure of deprivation.  
132 This particular school recruited for this study was located in an area of IMD of 5,376,

133 therefore in lowest quintile of deprivation in England. Furthermore 48% of the students were  
134 entitled to free school meals compared to an average of 16.3% in the country (Department for  
135 Education, 2013).

136 This study received ethical approval from the School of Health & Social Care at  
137 Teesside University (Study No 174/11). Prior to the study, the head teacher of the school  
138 received written information and provided informed consent. Twenty-one boys from each  
139 class then received an information pack, containing a letter to their parent or guardian, an  
140 information sheet, a written informed consent form for their parent or guardian, and an assent  
141 form for the child. Students who were injured or presented any condition affecting their  
142 ability to undertake exercise were ineligible to participate. Eligible students who signed the  
143 assent form and returned a completed parental/guardian informed consent form were included  
144 in the study. In total twelve students from Year 8 and nine students from Year 9 agreed to  
145 take part.

146 The school provided two, one hour PE lessons per week. Due to a previously  
147 established curriculum, one of the PE lessons was allocated to gymnastics, delivered indoors,  
148 and the other day to soccer, delivered outdoors. The 'Fair Play Game' study was conducted  
149 during 15 soccer lessons taught by the same teacher. Although the lesson content was chosen  
150 by the teacher, the option of soccer was appropriate for this intervention, due to it being an  
151 'invasion game'. Previous 'Fair Play Game' studies (Vidoni et al., 2012; Vidoni et al., 2014)  
152 were also conducted using invasion games (e.g. basketball and handball) as a unit of  
153 instruction.

154 The school PE teacher was also formally invited to participate and signed an informed  
155 consent. The PE teacher received training regarding the daily procedures of the intervention  
156 and a booklet including major components of the intervention, followed by a questions and

157 answers segment. The PE teacher had 8 years of teaching experience in PE including 5.5  
158 years in this particular school.

### 159 **Research design**

160 This study used a single-subject multiple baseline design across two classes (Cooper  
161 et al., 2007) to assess the effects of a dependent-group contingency strategy: ‘Fair Play  
162 Game’, on students’ physical activity levels during PE lessons. This design was chosen to  
163 examine the impact of the intervention among individual students, and in two different  
164 classes. Baseline data were collected in two classes in a staggered fashion to verify if the  
165 change on students’ number of steps (used for goal setting), and percentage of lesson spent  
166 on MVPA were effected by the intervention. An extended baseline for Year 9 enabled  
167 repeated measures of students’ levels of MVPA during baseline (i.e., typical teaching) and  
168 intervention phase. This design has been used in general and adapted physical education, and  
169 in sport and physical activity interventions (Holt, Kinchin, & Clarke, 2012; Jull & Mirenda,  
170 2016; Lieberman, Dunn, van der Mars, & McCubbin, 2000; Patrick, Ward, & Crouch, 1998;  
171 Samalot-Rivera & Porretta, 2013; Todd, Reid, & Kisber, 2010; Vidoni et al., 2014). Students  
172 in Year 8 started the intervention in their fifth soccer lesson, whilst those in Year 9 began the  
173 intervention in their eleventh soccer lesson.

### 174 **Procedures**

175 The same PE teacher taught soccer lessons to both classes once a week for 15 weeks.  
176 The PE lesson lasted for one hour, but the active part of the lesson lasted for approximately  
177 40 minutes. The lessons took place on an outdoor soccer field (approximately size: 100 m  
178 length and 60 m width), during the end of autumn, and throughout the winter season, and  
179 consisted of approximately: (a) 10 minutes warm-up, (b) 15 minutes drills, (c) 10 minutes  
180 game, and (d) 5 minutes closure.

## Effect of group contingency strategy on physical education

181           In the first day of the soccer unit of instruction, the PE teacher divided the students  
182 from each class into four teams with five students in each team. Each team had a minimum of  
183 two and a maximum of three students who were taking part on the study. The teacher  
184 explained that the participants would wear an accelerometer, which would measure their  
185 physical activity and steps during the lesson. The students were instructed to wear the  
186 accelerometer around the hip during the PE lesson. One accelerometer was assigned for each  
187 student and they used the same accelerometer throughout the 15 lessons.

### 188           **Baseline condition.**

189           The teacher taught typical soccer lessons during the first four days for the Year 8  
190 class, and ten days for the Year 9 class. Participants were asked to wear the accelerometers,  
191 but goals were not established and there was no reinforcement in relation to effort.

### 192           **Intervention.**

193           During the intervention, students were exposed to the ‘Fair Play Game’ intervention  
194 package. The package consisted of:

- 195           1. Goal setting: a chart was posted on the wall with information about goals set and  
196           goals achieved. The first goal was based on the average number of steps  
197           (measured by accelerometers) that the class has taken during the baseline  
198           condition.
- 199           2. Prompts: The teacher prompted the students at the beginning of the lesson to “give  
200           their best effort” to increase the number of steps taken during the lesson.  
201           Examples of prompts used are: “Let’s go, let’s go!”, “Keep moving!”, “Pass and  
202           run!”. During lesson closure, the teacher asked students to provide examples of  
203           how they could demonstrate effort during lessons, and students came up with the  
204           following ideas: moving on the field, passing the ball, engaging with their team,  
205           and avoiding staying still. Specifically, prompts were delivered at the beginning of



206 each lesson segment (warm-up, practice and game, and closure). There was no  
207 control of how many prompts were delivered because the lesson was not  
208 videotaped, but at least one prompt was provided as a reminder at the beginning of  
209 each segment.

210 3. Unidentified Student: The teacher explained that one unidentified student per  
211 team would be monitored and if this student accomplished the goal, the whole  
212 team would be awarded with a “YES” mark on the chart.

213 4. Reinforcement: At the end of the lesson the teacher pinpointed some good  
214 examples of students’ active behaviors that were observed during lesson, for  
215 example: staying active around the field, fast passes, getting the ball quickly when  
216 it goes out of the field, and rapid transitions for defence or attack.

217 5. Feedback: At the following PE lesson, the teacher then reviewed progress against  
218 the goal set on the chart. If the team achieved the goal this was further increased  
219 by 200 steps for this current lesson, otherwise it remained the same.

220 6. Reward: By the end of the 15 weeks observation period, each child from the teams  
221 which achieved 80% of the goals were rewarded with a Teesside University  
222 indoor soccer ball.

### 223 **Social Validity**

224 At the end of the intervention, all participants in the study, including the teacher, were  
225 invited to complete a social validity questionnaire (Vidoni et al., 2014). This assessed  
226 participants’ acceptability of the behaviors that were reinforced, the procedures used and  
227 social importance (Cooper et al., 2007).

228 The teacher was asked five questions relating to the ‘Fair Play Game’ strategy  
229 implementation: (a) if it was effective in increasing students’ engagement in PE, (b) if it was  
230 complicated to implement, (c) if it impinged on the time needed for their usual PE

231 instruction, (d) if it was an acceptable strategy to be used in all types of PE classes, and (e) if  
232 he would use the strategy in future classes. Responses to these questions were open-ended  
233 written comments.

234 The student questionnaire was anonymous and had four open-ended questions: (a) if  
235 they liked participating in the 'Fair Play Game' and why, (b) if it was important to give the  
236 best effort during PE and why, (c) if their teammates showed their best effort during the  
237 lessons and why, and (d) what they did to show their best effort during the lessons.

### 238 **Treatment Integrity**

239 During the intervention, a checklist was used to verify the treatment integrity. The  
240 checklist for the first lesson included: (a) if the teacher talked about best effort in the lesson,  
241 (b) if the teacher asked the students about examples of effort in the lesson, (c) if the teacher  
242 explained the chart on the wall, and (d) if the teacher explained that just one unidentified  
243 student per team would be targeted.

244 During the remaining lessons the checklist consisted of: (a) reminding the students  
245 that one team member would be tracked, (b) prompting students to show their best effort  
246 during lessons, (c) giving feedback about good examples of effort during lessons, and (d)  
247 adding the result of the previous lesson to the chart. The checklist was completed by one of  
248 the researchers in all the sessions and reliability was checked by a second researcher during  
249 40% of the lessons.

### 250 **Data recording, measures of the dependent variables and analysis**

251 Number of steps and MVPA were recorded using Actigraph GT1M accelerometers  
252 (Pensacola, FL, USA) during all lessons. Actigraph GT1M has shown to provide a reliable  
253 measurement of counts and steps (Silva , Mota, Esliger & Welk, 2010). Accelerometer data  
254 were recorded in every lesson at 15 seconds epochs, and accelerometers were set to initiate at  
255 the beginning of the PE lesson and stop at the end of the lesson. The exact start and finish

256 time of the lessons were recorded manually by the researcher. Data were processed after each  
257 lesson, and the number of steps checked for the selected participant in each team to establish  
258 if the goal was achieved.

259 Data were processed with Actilife version 6.5.4 software (Actigraph, LLC, Pensacola,  
260 FL) and filtered to the period of each lesson. Evenson cutpoints (Evenson, Catellier,  
261 Gill, Ondrak & Mc Murray, 2008) were applied to estimate MVPA during lesson. These  
262 cutpoints are considered the most accurate to estimate time spent at different exercise  
263 intensities in children and adolescents from 5 and 15 years old (Troost et al., 2011). To  
264 account for variation in lesson time, results are presented as a percentage of lesson time in  
265 MVPA. The lesson time was recorded for each session. This consisted of the time between  
266 the beginning of warm-up period to the end of the game, before the teacher provided the  
267 feedback for the students.

268 Only participants who attended a minimum of 80% of the lessons were included in  
269 the analysis. Three subjects from each class were selected for a single-subject analysis. The  
270 participants were selected according to their mean time spent in MVPA per lesson at  
271 baseline. The groups were subdivided as low, medium and high MVPA, defined by the  
272 standard deviation (SD) of the mean: 1. Low MVPA:  $< 0.3$  SD; 2. Medium MVPA:  $\pm 0.3$  SD  
273 and; 3. High MVPA:  $> 0.3$  SD. Participants from each category with the highest number of  
274 attendance were selected. A line graph was produced in which percentage of lesson time in  
275 MVPA in each session was plotted as a single datum point and connected to subsequent  
276 points throughout lessons. Results were analysed as within and between conditions (baseline  
277 and intervention) for the three selected individuals in each class. Analysis of trend, level and  
278 stability of the graphical data were based on the guidelines suggested by Lane and Gast  
279 (2014).

280 **Results**

281 The intervention was applied as planned in all the lessons. Inter-observer reliability of  
282 treatment integrity showed 100% agreement across 40% of lessons.

283 Nine (out of 12 participating) students from Year 8 and seven (out of 9 participating)  
284 students from Year 9 attended 80% of the lessons and were included in the study. On average  
285 the Year 8 participants (N=9) increased the % MVPA from baseline to intervention from 41.7  
286 % to 49.1% (7.4% difference). Likewise, Year 9 participants (N= 7) increased the % MVPA  
287 from 49.7% at baseline to 58.3% at intervention (8.7% difference).

288 The Year 8 class had the set target of 1800 steps for the first lesson. After the 11  
289 lessons, the target went up to 3600 steps for one team (met the goal in 10 of 11 lessons, 91%  
290 of the goals accomplished), two teams reached 3400 steps (met the goal in 9 of 11 lessons,  
291 82% of the goals accomplished) and one team reached 3200 steps (met the goal in 8 of 11  
292 lessons, 72% of the goals accomplished). For the Year 9 class the first target was set as 2700  
293 steps, after 5 lessons the target raised to 3100 steps for three teams (met the goal in 4 of 5  
294 lessons, 80% of goals accomplished) and 2900 steps for one of the teams (met the goal in 3 of  
295 5 lessons, 60% of goals accomplished).

296 Figures 1 shows the percentage of lesson at MPVA of six participants with low,  
297 medium and high MVPA at baseline from Years 8 and 9. As explained in the methods section  
298 the selection of participants in each category was defined by standard deviation from the  
299 mean and based on highest attendance.

### 300 **Low MVPA**

301 Results from the visual analysis using the method suggested by Lane & Gast, 2014  
302 show that the participant with low MVPA from Year 8, presented a variable, but a positive  
303 change in trend (decelerating- deteriorating to accelerating – improving) and improvement in  
304 level between baseline and intervention. Likewise, there was a large magnitude of change  
305 confirmed by the percentage of non-overlapping data (PND =100%).

306           The participant with low MVPA from Year 9 showed a continuous positive pattern of  
307 trend direction (accelerating – improving) which did not change between the baseline and  
308 intervention period and there was a low PND (40%) between conditions. However, data  
309 appeared to improve in stability during the intervention (within stability envelope: baseline =  
310 55.5% and intervention = 80%).

311           Functional relation is demonstrated when a controlled experiment shows that the  
312 change in the dependent variable was a reliable outcome of the specific manipulations of the  
313 intervention rather than confounding variables (Cooper et al., 2007). Results from Figure 1  
314 and visual analysis interpretation show that despite the fact that a positive change was seen  
315 between the baseline and intervention phase for the low MVPA Year 8 student, it is  
316 suggested that a weak functional relation is demonstrated for low MVPA students due to the  
317 lack of consistency during the replication with the low MVPA Year 9 student.

#### 318 **Medium MVPA**

319           Results from the visual analysis (Lane & Gast, 2014) suggest that the participant with  
320 medium MVPA from Year 8 showed a positive pattern of change in trend (decelerating-  
321 deteriorating to accelerating- improving) and level. However, there was a low magnitude of  
322 change (Medium PND = 27.3%). In contrast to Year 8, the participant with medium MVPA  
323 from Year 9 showed a negative trend, moving from accelerating- improving to decelerating –  
324 deteriorating and minimum or negative change in level and PND. Therefore, taking into  
325 consideration Figure 1 and the visual analysis interpretation, a functional relation was not  
326 demonstrated for the medium MVPA students.

#### 327 **High MVPA**

328           The participant with high MVPA from Year 8 showed nearly the same positive  
329 pattern of change in trend (decelerating- deteriorating to accelerating- improving) compared  
330 to the low and medium MVPA participants. However, there was a relatively low magnitude

331 of change (High PND = 60%). In contrast to Year 8, the participant with high MVPA from  
332 Year 9 showed a negative trend, moving from accelerating- improving to decelerating –  
333 deteriorating and a negative change in level and 0% PND. Therefore, the results from Figure  
334 1 and visual analysis interpretation (Lane & Gast, 2013) show that a functional relation can  
335 not be confirmed for the high MVPA students.

### 336 **Social Validity Questionnaires**

#### 337 **Teacher's responses**

338 The acceptability of the strategy was verified by the social validity questionnaire. The  
339 teacher responded that the 'Fair Play Game' helped students to extend their levels of  
340 engagement in the lessons. He reported that the strategy was not complicated, however PE  
341 teachers might have other learning targets rather than fitness. The teacher felt that the 'Fair  
342 Play Game' strategy took time away from learning soccer technique and knowledge. He  
343 reported that the use of accelerometers as a strategy would not be effective if the focus of the  
344 lesson was on teaching skill, development, and tactics. However, the teacher responded that  
345 he would use 'Fair Play Game' strategy again to help some students to increase their  
346 engagement in the lesson.

#### 347 **Students' responses**

348 Twenty students responded to the questionnaire (12 students from Year 8 and 8  
349 students from Year 9). All students responded that they liked participating in the study. The  
350 majority of the students responded that 'Fair Play Game' was fun and challenging. Other  
351 students responded that they liked knowing the number of steps taken and that they got to  
352 play more soccer.

353 The majority of students responded that being told to "give your best effort" in PE  
354 class is important because it helped them to be fit and move more. The majority of students  
355 reported that their teammates showed their best effort in the PE classes. Other students

356 responded that some teammates did not give their best effort because they were not  
357 participating in the study. Students responded that to show their effort they did not stop  
358 jogging or running during the lesson, they tried harder, and they also accomplished the tasks  
359 proposed by the teacher.

### 360 **Discussion**

361 The purpose of this study was to investigate the effect of a group contingency  
362 strategy: 'Fair Play Game', using accelerometers. This research also examined for the first  
363 time the effects of the 'Fair Play Game' strategy on PE students from an underserved area  
364 outside the USA. Single subject analysis revealed that the 'Fair Play Game' intervention  
365 showed a positive, but weak treatment effect on low active participants. Students with  
366 medium and high MVPA did not show positive changes between baseline and intervention  
367 phases.

368 The results from this study do not support the findings of previous studies, where the  
369 'Fair Play Game' strategy has been applied in PE classes (Vidoni et al., 2012; Vidoni et al.,  
370 2014). Several reasons might explain these differences in results. One possible reason is that  
371 the intervention was only delivered on one day a week. Therefore, the intervention took three  
372 months to complete because of several school breaks. In previous studies (Vidoni et al., 2012;  
373 Vidoni et al., 2014), students were exposed to daily PE lessons therefore the intervention was  
374 delivered continually. It is known that dose (intensity, frequency and duration) of delivering  
375 school-based physical activity is an important determinant of practice efficiency (Sun et al.,  
376 2013). Although the duration of the actual intervention was similar when comparing the  
377 interventions (14 to 17 days – 35 to 45 minutes long), the frequency at which it was delivered  
378 (weekly) was considerably lower in this study compared to previous studies.

379 Another possible reason was that the soccer lessons were delivered in an outdoor  
380 soccer field during the winter season while in previous studies similar interventions were

381 delivered in a gymnasium (Vidoni et al., 2012; Vidoni et al., 2014). Although prompts,  
382 feedback and goal settings were provided in the same manner as previous studies, the varied  
383 weather conditions might have impacted on students' participation in the classes. It has been  
384 stated that environmental variables in specific weather need to be taken into account when  
385 developing physical activity interventions (Tucker & Gilliland, 2007) and poor weather has  
386 been identified as a barrier to being physically active (Belanger, Gray-Donald, O'Loughlin,  
387 Paradis & Hanley, 2009). Furthermore, despite our efforts to provide prompts in a consistent  
388 manner, we have not recorded the number of prompts provided. The lack of information  
389 concerning the number of prompts delivered during the lesson can be considered a limitation  
390 of this study. Vidoni & Ward (2009) found that when the teacher did not deliver prompts the  
391 occurrence of target behaviors decreased in comparison with those that were frequently  
392 prompted. In addition, in previous studies the participants were from schools located in  
393 middle to high socio-economic areas in United States, whereas in this study the school was  
394 located in an underserved area of England. Previous studies performed in America showed  
395 that children attending schools in high SES areas had 4.4 minutes per day more of MVPA  
396 compared to children who attended schools in low SES areas (Carlson et al., 2014).  
397 Similarly, British adolescents (11-12 years old) from low SES areas present higher levels of  
398 sedentary behavior compared to children from affluent areas (Brodersen et al., 2007).  
399 Therefore, the unsuccessful results seen in this study might be partly associated with a  
400 population that is potentially more physically inactive, and therefore might require different  
401 triggers to change their behavior.

402         The number of students involved in this study was low compared to previous studies  
403 (Vidoni et al., 2012; Vidoni et al., 2014). Less than 60% of the students from the Year 8 class  
404 and 40% of students from the Year 9 class agreed to participate in the study. Although  
405 researchers explained the importance of the study and mentioned the incentive at the end, few



## Effect of group contingency strategy on physical education

406 students provided the signed parental/guardian informed consent. Considering that goals were  
407 set to individuals within a team, and not all students in the team were participating in the  
408 intervention, this might have prevented individuals who were taking part in the study from  
409 showing their best effort. Perhaps if all participants were placed within the same groups it  
410 would encourage their team affiliation and would impact the results.

411 Similarly, it is important to note that only one teacher responded the social validity  
412 questionnaire, and his views might not be representative of most teachers' opinion. The PE  
413 teacher emphasized that "not all PE lessons are about fitness". It is known that the goals of  
414 PE are wider than fitness and include improvement of motor competencies, knowledge of  
415 principles and concepts, and development of personal and social skills (National Association  
416 for Sport and Physical Education & American Heart Association, 2012). However, this  
417 intervention was limited to target MVPA in PE classes. Although the intervention package  
418 was implemented as planned (fidelity of treatment), it could be suggested that the teachers'  
419 prompts or feedback to students were not enough to increase students' levels of participation.  
420 As mentioned before, it is also possible that this particular group of children requires more  
421 frequent and/or varied stimuli in order to change their behavior in class.

422 One of the limitations of this study was the use of a multiple baseline across two  
423 classes. Although it involved three replications across students (low, medium and high  
424 MVPA), it demonstrated a relatively weak experimental control. Perhaps a third tier in the  
425 multiple baseline design would provide a better representation of replications, predictions and  
426 verifications of the experiment.

427 This study has some strengths including a more accurate measure of physical activity  
428 (i.e. accelerometers) compared to other studies which applied the same intervention (i.e. heart  
429 rate monitors and pedometers) (Vidoni et al., 2012; Vidoni et al., 2014). Accelerometers are  
430 considered the most valid objective measure of physical activity (Eston, Rowlands, &

431 Ingledeu, 1998). However, the use of accelerometers in everyday practice might be  
432 unfeasible because of the cost of equipment and skills necessary for data processing. The use  
433 of pedometers might be more appropriate for everyday use. However, the limitations of using  
434 pedometers to measure physical activity should be taken into account, such as inability to  
435 measure non-ambulatory activities (McNamara, Hudson, & Taylor, 2010).

436         It is also important to understand the contribution of PE towards helping children to  
437 meet the minimum guidelines for physical activity. Accelerometry data from Health Survey  
438 England 2008 indicates that only 7% of the boys aged 11 to 15 old children meet the current  
439 recommendation of at least 60 minutes of MVPA per day (Health Survey for England, 2008).  
440 Schools and in particular PE classes are seen as important settings for physical activity  
441 promotion (Bailey, 2006). ‘Fair Play Game’, might be an important strategy to support  
442 children to increase MVPA during PE lessons (U.S. Department of Health and Human  
443 Services, 2010). However, it is important to note that the frequency at which the intervention  
444 is delivered, and the number of students in class that are taking part on the intervention are  
445 important for the intervention to be effective.

446         In summary, ‘Fair Play Game’ might be an important strategy to increase MVPA in  
447 low active children during PE lessons. The use of this strategy might support the objective  
448 stated in a recent paper by Sallis et al. (2012) that PE classes should focus on health-related  
449 physical activity and fitness, and students should be active for at least 50% of the lesson time.

### References

- Bailey, R. (2006). Physical education and sport in schools: a review of benefits and outcomes. *Journal of School Health*, 76, 397-401. doi: 10.1111/j.1746-1561.2006.00132.x
- Barrish, H. H., Saunders, M., & Wolf, M. (1969). Good behavior game: Effects of individual contingencies for group consequences on disruptive behavior in a classroom. *Journal of Applied Behavior Analysis*, 2, 119-124. doi:10.1901/jaba.1969.2-119
- Belanger, M., Gray-Donald, K., O'Loughlin, J., Paradis, G., & Hanley, J. (2009). Influence of weather conditions and season on physical activity in adolescents. *Annals of Epidemiology*, 19, 180-186. doi: 10.1901/jaba.1969.2-119
- Brodersen, N.H., Steptoe, A., Boniface, D.R., & Wardle, J. (2007). Trends in physical activity and sedentary behaviour in adolescence: ethnic and socioeconomic differences. *British Journal Sports Medicine*, 41, 140-144. doi:10.1136/bjism.2006.031138
- Carlson, J.A., Mignano, A.M., Norman, G.J., McKenzie, T.L., & Kerr, J. (2014). Socioeconomic disparities in elementary school practices and children's physical activity during school. *American Journal of Health Promotion*, 28, S47-S53. doi:10.4278/ajhp.130430-QUAN-206
- Cooper, J.O., Heron, T.E. & Heward, W.L. (2007). *Applied Behavior Analysis*, Upper Saddle River, NJ: Merrill/Prentice Hall.
- De Bourdeaudhuij, I., Van, C.E., Spittaels, H., Oppert, J.M., Rostami, C., Brug, J. & Maes, L. (2011). School-based interventions promoting both physical activity and healthy eating in Europe: a systematic review within the HOPE project. *Obesity Reviews*, 12, 205-216. doi: 10.1111/j.1467-789X.2009.00711.x

## Effect of group contingency strategy on physical education

- Department for Education. (2013) *Schools, Pupils, and their Characteristics*, January 2013. London.
- Eston, R.G., Rowlands, A.V. & Ingledeu, D.K. (1998). Validity of heart rate, pedometry, and accelerometry for predicting the energy cost of children's activities. *Journal of Applied Physiology*, *84*, 362-371.
- Evenson, K.R., Catellier, D.J., Gill, K, Ondrak, K.S., & McMurray, R.G. (2008). Calibration of two objective measures of physical activity for children. *Journal of Sports Sciences*, *26*, 1557-1565. doi: 10.1080/02640410802334196
- Fairclough, S. & Stratton, G. (2005). Physical activity levels in middle and high school physical education: A review. *Pediatric Exercise Science*, *17*, 217-236.
- Health Survey for England (2008). *Health Survey for England 2008: Physical activity and fitness*. Volume 1. Leeds: The NHS Information Centre for health and social care.
- Holt, J.E., Kinchin, G., & Clarke, G. (2012). Effects of peer-assessed feedback, goal setting and a group contingency on a performance and learning by 10-12-year old academy soccer players. *Physical Education and Sport Pedagogy*, *17*(3), 231-250. doi: 10.1080/17408989.2012.690568
- Jull, S., & Miranda, P. (2016). Effects of a staff training program on community instructors' ability to teach swimming skills to children with autism. *Journal of Positive Behavior Interventions*, *18*(1), 29-40. doi: 10.1177/1098300715576797
- Kahn, E.B., Ramsey, L.T., Brownson, R.C., Heath, G.W., Howze, E.H., Powell, K.E. & Corso, P. (2002). The effectiveness of interventions to increase physical activity. A systematic review. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, *22*, 73-107. doi: 10.1016/S0749-3797(02)00434-8

## Effect of group contingency strategy on physical education

- Lee, M., & Ward, P. (2009). Generalization of tactics in tag rugby from practice to games in middle school physical education. *Physical Education and Sport Pedagogy, 14*(2), 189-207. doi:10.1080/17408980801974937
- Lane, J.D. & Gast, D.L. (2014). Visual analysis in single case experimental design studies: Brief review and guidelines. *Neuropsychological Rehabilitation, 24*, 445-463. doi:10.1080/09602011.2013.815636
- Lieberman, L.J., Dunn, J.M., van der Mars, H., & McCubbin, J. (2000). Peer tutors' effects on activity levels of deaf students in inclusive elementary physical education. *Adapted Physical Activity Quarterly, 17*, 20-38.
- Lonsdale, C., Rosenkranz, R.R., Peralta, L.R., Bennie, A., Fahey, P., & Luban, D.R. (2013). A systematic review and meta-analysis of interventions designed to increase moderate-to-vigorous physical activity in school physical education lessons. *Preventive Medicine, 56*, 152-161. doi:10.1016/j.ypmed.2012.12.004
- McNamara, E., Hudson, Z., & Taylor, S.J. (2010). Measuring activity levels of young people: the validity of pedometers. *British Medical Bulletin, 95*, 121-137. doi:10.1093/bmb/ldq016
- National Association for S, Physical E and American Heart A. (2012). *2012 Shape of the Nation report: Status of Physical Education in the USA*. Reston, VA: American Alliance for Health, Physical Education, Recreation and Dance.
- Noble, M., Right, G., Dibben, C., Smith, G., McLennan, D., Antila, A. & Braswell, S. (2004). *The English Indices of Deprivation 2004*. London: Neighbourhood Renewal Unit, Office of the Deputy Prime Minister.
- Patrick, C.A., Ward, P., & Coruch, D.W. (1998). Effects of holding students accountable for social behaviors. *Journal of Teaching in Physical Education, 17*, 143-156.

## Effect of group contingency strategy on physical education

- Sallis, J.F. & McKenzie, T.L. (1991). Physical education's role in public health. *Research Quarterly for Exercise & Sport*, 62, 124-137. doi:10.1080/02701367.1991.10608701
- Sallis, J.F., McKenzie, T.L., Beets, M.W., Beighle, A., Erwin, H., & Lee, S. (2012). Physical education's role in public health: steps forward and backward over 20 years and HOPE for the future. *Research Quarterly for Exercise & Sport*, 83, 125-135. doi:10.1080/02701367.2012.10599842
- Samalot-Rivera, A., & Porretta, D. (2013). The influence of social skills instruction on sport and game related behaviors of students with emotional or behavioral disorders. *Physical Education and Sport Pedagogy*, 18(2), 117-132. doi:10.1080/17408989.2011.631004
- Siedentop, D., Hastie, P., & van der Mars, H. (2011). *Complete guide to Sport Education*. Human Kinetics, Champaign, IL
- Silva, P., Mota, J., Esliger, D. & Welk, G. (2010). Technical reliability assessment of the Actigraph GT1M Accelerometer. *Measurement in Physical Education and Exercise Science*, 14, 79-91. doi:10.1080/10913671003715524
- Stalsberg, R. & Pedersen A.V. (2010). Effects of socioeconomic status on the physical activity in adolescents: a systematic review of the evidence. *Scandinavian journal of medicine & science in sport*, 20, 368-383. doi: 10.1111/j.1600-0838.2009.01047.x
- Sun, C., Pezic, A., Tikellis, G., Ponsonby, A.L., Wake, M., Carlin, J.B. & Dewyer, T. (2013). Effects of school-based interventions for direct delivery of physical activity on fitness and cardiometabolic markers in children and adolescents: a systematic review of randomized controlled trials. *Obesity Reviews*, 14, 818-838. doi: 10.1111/obr.12047
- Theodore, L.A., Bray, M.A., Kehle, T.J. & Dioguardi, R.J. (2004). Contemporary review of group-oriented contingencies for disruptive behavior. *Journal of Applied School Psychology*, 20, 79-101. doi: 10.1300/J370v20n01\_06

## Effect of group contingency strategy on physical education

- Todd, T., Reid, G., & Butler-Kisber, L. (2010). Cycling for students with ASD: Self-regulation promotes sustained physical activity. *Adapted Physical Activity Quarterly*, 27(3), 226-241.
- Trost, S.G. (2001) Objective measurement of physical activity in youth: current issues, future directions. *Exercise and Sport Sciences Reviews*, 29, 32-36.doi: 10.1097/00003677-200101000-00007
- Trost, S.G., Loprinzi, P.D., Moore, R. & Pfeiffer, K.A. (2011). Comparison of accelerometer cut points for predicting activity intensity in youth. *Medicine & Science in Sports & Exercise*, 43, 1360-1368.doi:10.1249/MSS.0b013e318206476e
- Tucker, P. & Gilliland, J. (2007). The effect of season and weather on physical activity: a systematic review. *Public Health*, 121, 909-922.doi: 10.1016/j.puhe.2007.04.009
- U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (USDHHS). (2000). *Healthy People 2010*, Conference Edition. Washington, DC: U.S: Government Printing Office.
- U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (USDoHH). (2010). Strategies to improve the quality of physical education. *National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Division of Adolescent and School Health*: 1-3.
- van Sluijs, E.M., McMinn, A.M. & Griffin, S.J. (2008). Effectiveness of interventions to promote physical activity in children and adolescents: systematic review of controlled trials. *British Journal of Sports Medicine*, 42, 653-657.  
doi:10.1136/bmj.39320.843947.BE
- Vidoni, C. & Ward, P. (2006). Effects of a Dependent Group-Oriented Contingency on Middle School Physical Education Students' Fair Play Behaviors. *Journal of Behavioral Education*, 15, 80-91. doi:10.1007/s10864-006-9012-z

## Effect of group contingency strategy on physical education

- Vidoni C., Azevedo, L.B. & Eberline, A. (2012). Effects of a group contingency strategy on middle school physical education students heart rates. *European Physical Education Review, 18*, 78-96. doi:10.1177/1356336X11430652
- Vidoni, C. & Ulman, J. (2012). The fair play game: Promoting social skills in physical education. *Strategies, 25*, 26-30. doi:10.1080/08924562.2012.10592149
- Vidoni, C., Lee, C.H. & Azevedo, L.B. (2014). Fair Play Game: a group contingency strategy to increase students' active behaviours in physical education. *Early Child Development and Care, 184*, 1127-1141. doi:10.1080/03004430.2013.847834
- Vogler, E.W. & French, R.W. (1983). The effects of a group contingency strategy on behaviorally disordered students in physical education. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport, 54*, 273-277. doi:10.1080/02701367.1983.10605306
- Ward, P. & Dunaway, S. (1995). Effects of contingent music on laps run in a high school physical education class. *Physical Educator, 52*, 2.